

CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE



**AUDIT OF OFFICE OF
ECONOMIC AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT
FUELING TRANSACTIONS OVERSIGHT**

Report CW015-2021-04

December 28, 2020

RADFORD K. SNELDING, CPA, CIA, CFE

CITY AUDITOR

TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND	1
OBJECTIVES	1
SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY.....	2
FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	2
1. Fuel Use Log Not Being Maintained.....	3
2. Fueling Reports Not Being Adequately Reviewed for Irregularities	5
Appendix A	7
Appendix B.....	8
MANAGEMENT RESPONSE	9

AUDIT OF OFFICE OF ECONOMIC AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT FUELING TRANSACTIONS OVERSIGHT Report CW015-2021-04

BACKGROUND

The city's Fleet and Fuel Services Division (Fleet Services) of the Operations & Maintenance Department administers the city's fueling operations. Fleet Services oversees the operation of 19 city fuel sites. City employees utilize the fuel pumps at these fuel sites for fueling city vehicles and equipment.

The Office of Economic and Urban Development (EUD) staff utilize city fuel sites for fueling department vehicles and equipment. To access a city fuel pump, a plastic electronic fob known as a prokee must be placed into a slot at the pump.

All city vehicles have an assigned prokee that is programmed with that vehicle's information. These prokees are referred to as primary prokees. In order to access a fuel pump for fueling equipment without a designated prokee or for filling a gas can, city employees must utilize what is referred to as a secondary prokee. Considering secondary prokees are not assigned to any specific vehicle or piece of equipment, there is greater risk of fuel theft occurring with these prokees.

In order to obtain a secondary prokee, a city employee and their manager must complete and sign a secondary prokee request form (see Appendix A). This form requires the employee and manager to agree to comply with a list of rules documented on the form including "tracking all fuel disbursements" and the "reconciliation of disbursement logs." The *Small Equipment Fueling Operations Procedure (O&M-FS-Fuel02)* further explains that the departments are responsible for "recording all disbursements on a log sheet (see Appendix B) and for reconciling the log sheet against an automated monthly disbursement report provided by the Fleet Services Division."

Fleet Services currently generates 1) quarterly primary prokee fueling transaction reports and 2) monthly secondary prokee fueling transaction reports from the city's fueling system and emails these reports to city departments. According to the *Fuel Transaction Monitoring Procedure (O&M-FS-Fuel06)*, departments are responsible for "reviewing reports for assigned units, identifying and investigating concerns, and for taking appropriate action for misuse of the fuel system by subordinate personnel."

During 2019, EUD had 1,477 primary prokee transactions totaling 12,265 gallons and 63 secondary prokee transactions totaling 274 gallons.

OBJECTIVES

Our audit objectives were as follows:

- To determine whether a secondary prokee request form signed by a current employee and manager exists for every secondary prokee issued to EUD.

AUDIT OF OFFICE OF ECONOMIC
AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT
FUELING TRANSACTIONS OVERSIGHT
CW015-2021-04
December 28, 2020

- To determine whether EUD is maintaining a secondary prokee use log and reconciling the log to the monthly secondary prokee fueling reports.
- To determine whether EUD management is reviewing the primary and secondary prokee fueling reports from Fleet Services for irregular transactions and researching any identified irregularities.
- To determine whether use logs, reconciliations, and fueling report review documentation are being retained in accordance with the fueling procedures.

SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

The scope of our work was limited to the management controls within the context of the audit objectives and scope of the audit. The scope of the audit was limited to the review of fueling logs, reconciliations, and fueling reports in calendar year 2019. The last date of fieldwork was March 11, 2020.

Our audit methodology included:

- Review of fueling policies and procedures
- Review of secondary prokee request forms
- Review of fueling reports issued by Fleet Services
- Interviews with city employees
- Testing of reconciliations of fueling use logs to fueling reports

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards except for the requirement for an external peer review every three years. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The following findings and conclusions to the audit objectives were noted:

A secondary prokee request form is on file with Fleet Services for each of EUD's two secondary prokees. A secondary prokee request form signed by a current employee is on file with Fleet Services for both of these secondary prokees; however, one of the forms is missing the signature of a manager. No secondary prokee use log is being maintained by EUD and accordingly, no reconciliation of a use log to the secondary prokee fueling reports is being performed. (Finding #1)

The monthly and quarterly fueling reports provided to EUD are not being adequately reviewed for irregular transactions by EUD staff. Documented evidence of this review is needed. (Finding #2)

AUDIT OF OFFICE OF ECONOMIC
AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT
FUELING TRANSACTIONS OVERSIGHT
CW015-2021-04
December 28, 2020

Further information on these issues is contained in the following sections. While other issues were identified and discussed with management, they were deemed less significant for reporting purposes.

Contributors to this report included:

Radford K. Snelding, CPA, CIA, CFE
City Auditor

Bryan L. Smith, CPA, CFE
Internal Audit Section Manager

Gary L. Phillips, CFE
Senior Internal Auditor

1. Fuel Use Log Not Being Maintained

Criteria

The *Small Equipment Fueling Operations Procedure (O&M-FS-Fuel02)* states the following:

In order to obtain assignment of a secondary unit prokee for general utilization (e.g., small equipment, rental unit, gas can), a user organization must complete and submit a “Secondary Prokee Request Form”. The form allows the user to select all 3 fuel types for approval, plus define the daily limit of each type.

A secondary prokee will be assigned to a specific individual only, and that individual is responsible for the appropriate use of all gasoline dispensed using the prokee, for recording all disbursements on a log sheet, and for reconciling the log sheet against an automated monthly disbursement report provided by Fleet Services Division. Fleet Services Division recommends that individuals responsible for the secondary prokees be at a supervisory level or higher.

Managers are responsible for assignment of prokee responsibility to a specific individual and for ensuring that tracking logs are kept appropriately and are reconciled with monthly reports received from Fleet Services Division. Employees who are designated for assignment of a prokee are responsible for ensuring proper use of fuel disbursement, following operational processes and rules, maintaining adequate logs, and reconciling disbursements on a monthly basis.

Fueling operations of this type provide a potential for misuse and must be monitored and controlled. The reconciliation records are subject to review by Fleet Services Division or the Office of the City Auditor.

AUDIT OF OFFICE OF ECONOMIC
AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT
FUELING TRANSACTIONS OVERSIGHT
CW015-2021-04
December 28, 2020

Tracking logs and reconciliation documents are under the control of the user organizations, and it is recommended they be kept for a minimum of one year.

The secondary prokee request form signed by an employee and their manager includes the following rules agreed to by each employee requesting a secondary prokee:

- *User is responsible for tracking all fuel disbursements.*
- *Respective management staff members are responsible for the oversight of fuel operations and reconciliation of disbursement logs.*

Condition

Considering secondary prokees are not assigned to a specific vehicle or piece of equipment, there is greater risk of fuel theft. Accordingly, Fleet Services requires departments to record secondary prokee usage on a use log and to reconcile the use log to the monthly secondary prokee fueling system reports. See the suggested use log at Appendix B.

EUD has two secondary prokees that were used 63 times during 2019. A secondary prokee request form signed by a current employee is on file with Fleet Services for both of these secondary prokees; however, one of the forms is missing the signature of a manager. No secondary prokee use log is being maintained by EUD and therefore, no reconciliation of a use log to the monthly secondary prokee fueling reports is being performed.

Cause

- EUD staff were not aware of the requirement to maintain a secondary prokee use log or to perform a reconciliation of the use log to the secondary prokee fueling reports from Fleet Services.

Effect

- Fuel theft may occur without detection.

Recommendations

- 1.1 EUD management should have the manager overseeing the use of secondary prokees sign the secondary prokee request form without a manager signature and submit it to Fleet Services.
- 1.2 EUD management should document and implement department procedures requiring the use of a secondary prokee use log and the reconciliation of the use log to the monthly secondary prokee fueling reports. These procedures should require that any identified differences be researched and their resolution documented. The reconciliations should be signed and dated by the preparer and a manager who has reviewed and approved the

reconciliations. The procedures should also require that use logs, fueling reports, and reconciliations be retained for a minimum of a year to comply with fueling policy.

2. Fueling Reports Not Being Adequately Reviewed for Irregularities

Criteria

According to the *Fuel Transaction Monitoring Procedure (O&M-FS-Fuel06)*, departments are responsible for reviewing the fueling reports for any irregular transactions:

The Fleet Services Division Manager is responsible for generating and sending the various reports to all departments. The respective managers for the various budget organizational numbers are responsible for reviewing reports for assigned units, identifying and investigating concerns, and for taking appropriate action for misuse of the fuel system by subordinate personnel.

Records generated by user divisions should be maintained for a minimum of 1 year.

Condition

The monthly and quarterly fueling reports provided to EUD are not being adequately reviewed for irregular transactions and there is no documentation retained showing evidence of a review.

While a supervisor stated that he receives the quarterly primary prokee fueling reports, he is primarily using these reports to verify that his employees are fueling the vehicles daily rather than specifically reviewing the report for irregular transactions. The secondary prokee fueling reports were not being reviewed for irregular transactions.

Cause

- Lack of established department procedures requiring the review of the fueling reports and the maintenance and retention of documented evidence of the review.

Effect

- Fuel theft may occur without detection.

Recommendation

- 2.1 EUD management should document and implement department procedures requiring that the monthly and quarterly fueling reports be reviewed by a manager for irregular transactions and that this review be documented. Documented evidence of the review should include a copy of the fueling reports along with the reviewer's notes on research

AUDIT OF OFFICE OF ECONOMIC
AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT
FUELING TRANSACTIONS OVERSIGHT
CW015-2021-04
December 28, 2020

into irregular transactions, the reviewer's signature, and the date of the review. Review documentation should be retained for a minimum of a year to comply with fueling policy.

Appendix A

SECONDARY PROKEE REQUEST FORM

I, _____, hereby request secondary prokee(s) to access to the CLV fuel system and agree to follow the process steps, and abide by the rules listed below. The process for dispensing fuel is as follows:

Prokee Transaction

- | |
|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Drive up to appropriate fuel dispenser • Insert prokee into electronic reader • Remove and reinsert prokee as prompted • As prompted enter employee identification number • As prompted enter pump number desired • Remove respective nozzle and turn pump lever to initiate operation and squeeze nozzle handle to dispense fuel • Return pump lever and nozzle to original positions upon completion • Insert prokee into electronic reader to update daily data |
|---|
- **CLV fueling locations and products are for official approved use only. Misuse may constitute theft in accordance with *NRS 205.0832*, and in accordance with the City Fraud Policy FSD will report any reasonable suspicion of theft or fraud to the Department of Detention and Enforcement City Marshals.**
 - No smoking is allowed in or around a fuel pump area.
 - No loitering is allowed in or around a fuel pump area.
 - A vehicle in a fuel pump area is to be turned off and attended to at all times.
 - During fueling activities the vehicle operator is to be in control of the fuel pump nozzle until it is returned to the dispenser cabinet.
 - Utilize approved transport containers only.
 - **User is responsible for tracking all fuel disbursements.**
 - **Respective management staff members are responsible for the oversight of fuel operations and reconciliation of disbursement logs.**
 - Follow the process steps as provided above, and as prompted by the electronic reader. Failure to do so may result in automated lockout of fueling privileges. Restoration of lockout applications will be at the discretion of FSD.
 - Report the loss of any prokee immediately. Cost assessments will apply to prokee replacements.
 - The user is responsible for knowing and following all other applicable safety rules and precautions
 - **Use of the City fuel sites is a privilege and not a right of employment. Continued or blatant misuse of the system will result in temporary or permanent suspension of fueling privileges.**

Prokee Request No.	Unit No.	Max Gallons Gasoline	Max Gallons Diesel	Max Gallons Bio-Diesel
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				

Employee Printed Name

Employee Signature

Date

Manager Printed Name

Manager Signature

Date

MANAGEMENT RESPONSE

1. Fuel Use Log Not Being Maintained

- 1.1 EUD management should have the manager overseeing the use of secondary prokees sign the secondary prokee request form without a manager signature and submit it to Fleet Services.

Management Action Plan: The form has been signed and submitted to Fleet Services.

Estimated Date of Completion: 9/15/2020

- 1.2 EUD management should document and implement department procedures requiring the use of a secondary prokee use log and the reconciliation of the use log to the monthly secondary prokee fueling reports. These procedures should require that any identified differences be researched and their resolution documented. The reconciliations should be signed and dated by the preparer and a manager who has reviewed and approved the reconciliations. The procedures should also require that use logs, fueling reports, and reconciliations be retained for a minimum of a year to comply with fueling policy.

Management Action Plan: Policy has already been developed and implemented; will write it up formally.

Estimated Date of Completion: 10/01/2020

2. Fueling Reports Not Being Adequately Reviewed for Irregularities

- 2.1 EUD management should document and implement department procedures requiring that the monthly and quarterly fueling reports be reviewed by a manager for irregular transactions and that this review be documented. Documented evidence of the review should include a copy of the fueling reports along with the reviewer's notes on research into irregular transactions, the reviewer's signature, and the date of the review. Review documentation should be retained for a minimum of a year to comply with fueling policy.

Management Action Plan: Policy has already been developed, however Parking Services needs to collaborate with Fleet on getting the quarterly reports in an excel format so reconciliations can be completed in a timely manner. Once we are able to obtain the reports in Excel, we will draft the policy and implement.

Estimated Date of Completion: 11/01/2020 (depending on ability to receive excel reports)